



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

World Heritage

43 COM

WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2

Paris, 19 June 2019

Original: English / French

UNITED NATIONS EDUCATIONAL, SCIENTIFIC AND CULTURAL ORGANIZATION

CONVENTION CONCERNING THE PROTECTION OF THE WORLD CULTURAL AND NATURAL HERITAGE

WORLD HERITAGE COMMITTEE

Forty-third session

Baku, Republic of Azerbaijan
30 June - 10 July 2019

**Item 7A of the Provisional Agenda: State of conservation of the properties
inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger**

SUMMARY

In accordance with Section IV B, paragraphs 190-191 of the *Operational Guidelines*, the Committee shall review annually the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger. This review shall include such monitoring procedures and expert missions as might be determined necessary by the Committee.

This document contains information on the state of conservation of properties inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger. The World Heritage Committee is requested to review the reports on the state of conservation of properties contained in this document. The full reports of Reactive Monitoring missions requested by the World Heritage Committee are available at the following Web address in their original language:
<https://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/43COM/documents>

All state of conservation reports are also available through the World Heritage State of conservation Information System at the following Web address:
<https://whc.unesco.org/en/soc>

Decision required: The Committee is requested to review the following state of conservation reports. The Committee may wish to adopt the draft Decision presented at the end of each state of conservation report.

TABLE OF CONTENT

NATURAL PROPERTIES	2
AFRICA	2
16. Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) (N 199bis).....	2
CULTURAL PROPERTIES	7
ARAB STATES.....	7
21. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of Iraq	7
22. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)	10
25. Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) (C 184)	10
26. Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) (C 362)	13
29. Hebron/AI-Khalil Old Town (Palestine) (C 1565).....	16
37. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic	16
38. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)	20
39. Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) (C 385)	24
40. Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) (C 192).....	28
ASIA AND PACIFIC	32
44. Historic Centre of Shakhrisyabz (Uzbekistan) (C 885)	32

NATURAL PROPERTIES

AFRICA

16. Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) (N 199bis)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (ix)(x)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2014-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Poaching and the ensuing dramatic declines in elephant populations, and the effects thereof on the ecosystem; tendering of logging rights for large-scale deforestation resulting from the proposed hydropower dam

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
In progress

Corrective measures identified

In progress

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

In progress

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 3 (from 1984-1999)

Total amount approved: USD 67,980

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

N/A

Previous monitoring missions

June 2007, November 2008 and December 2013: Joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring missions. February 2017: IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Significant decline of wildlife populations due to poaching
- Insufficient funding and management
- Modification of legal protective status to permit mineral and hydrocarbon prospecting and mining inside the property
- Excision of land from the property to accommodate a uranium mine
- Operationalizing the uranium mining project
- Inadequate tourism management and development
- Proposed dam development without adequate impact assessment
- Tendering of logging rights for the proposed dam
- Lack of disaster preparedness
- Need for buffer zone
- Need for increased involvement of local communities
- Alien invasive species

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/>

Current conservation issues

On 28 February 2019, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation of the property, available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/199/documents/>, with the following information:

- Progress report of the Emergency Action Plan (EAP) is submitted. Intensified patrolling has led to a significant reduction of poaching, with only 5 elephant carcasses found in the property in 2017/18;
- A new General Management Plan (GMP) will be developed following the approval of the new 5 year Strategic Plan for the Tanzanian Wildlife Management Authority (TAWA);
- The results of the October 2018 aerial wildlife census are not yet available, but will be used to establish the baseline for the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR). The elephant demographic survey was also conducted;
- Two rhino protection and monitoring units have been established. One rhino was reported in October 2018;
- The Mkuju River uranium mining project is deferred until further notice but a full Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) will be conducted in case In Situ Leaching technology is used. Discussions are underway to add an area in the Mbarika Mountains to compensate for the area excluded by the 2012 boundary modification;
- The updated hydrology report for the Kidunda Dam (dated December 2017) was submitted. A revised EIA is available but not yet submitted;
- The action plan to protect the Selous-Niassa corridor is still not approved but some actions to protect this important wildlife corridor are underway;
- The EIA for the Rufiji Hydropower project (RHPP), including an Environmental Management Plan with mitigation measures, was approved, and the project is scheduled to proceed. The project was re-designed and the reservoir will now cover 91,400 ha, an area which will be logged;
- The State Party acknowledges that under Tanzanian Law a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) is required for hydropower projects, but notes that "*the resources and time required for an SEA were found to mismatch the pace that RHPP is being implemented*". An SEA is currently being prepared to assess the cumulative impacts of RHPP on the property and its landscape;
- The State Party proposed to postpone the Reactive Monitoring mission requested by the Committee in its Decision **42 COM 7A.56** pending logistical arrangements and collection of all necessary information.

On 31 October 2018, the World Heritage Centre sent a letter to the State Party of Egypt, in response to reports that the RHPP will be constructed in cooperation with two Egyptian companies. No response was received. Therefore, on 19 December 2018, the Director of the World Heritage Centre met with the Ambassador of Egypt to UNESCO to express serious concern about the State Party of Egypt's support to the project, recalling Article 6.3 of the *Convention*. A statement was released in response to frequent media inquiries (<http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1920>).

In November 2018, the World Heritage Centre sent a letter to the State Party in response to reports indicating that the infrastructure works related to RHPP had started. No response was received, however in January 2019 the Director of the World Heritage Centre met with the Ambassador of the United Republic of Tanzania to UNESCO to reiterate UNESCO's grave concern over the reported start of the RHPP.

In March 2019, the State Party submitted an EIA (dated May 2016) for the Kito-1 oil and gas exploration project proposed in the Kilombero Valley Ramsar site adjacent to the property. The studies on the hydrological regime of the Kilombero floodplain and a specific assessment of potential downstream impacts on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) are underway.

In July 2018, the World Heritage Centre and IUCN commented on the first draft EIA for RHPP. Following receipt of the revised version in December 2018, IUCN commissioned an independent technical review of the EIA (available at <https://portals.iucn.org/library/node/48425>), which was sent to the State Party on

18 April 2019. Both assessments concluded that the EIA falls considerably short of acceptable standards.

On 21 May 2019, the State Party submitted the SEA for RHPP.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre and IUCN

The reported reduction in poaching is noted and it is hoped that this will be confirmed by the 2018 aerial census results, once available. The State Party's efforts to implement the EAP are commendable, however, such actions to secure the values of the property are at odds with decisions to proceed with the large scale RHPP and its consequent catastrophic impacts as noted below. While acknowledging the results of the demographic study, it should be followed by a population model to estimate the recovery of the elephant population, assuming poaching has been reduced drastically. It is of utmost concern that the signs of remaining rhino were reported in the area to be logged and inundated for the RHPP.

It is of utmost concern that the development of the RHPP is going ahead against the Committee's repeated requests not to take a decision or start works prior to the completion of a comprehensive SEA undertaken to the highest international standards, review of the SEA by IUCN and considering alternatives. The Committee has an unequivocal position that the construction of dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of World Heritage properties is incompatible with World Heritage status (Decision **40 COM 7**). Furthermore, this contradicts the State Party's earlier commitments to not undertake any development activities without the Committee's prior approval (Decision **36 COM 8B.43**). The RHPP will involve the construction of a 130 m-high dam on the Rufiji River, the creation of a 100 km-long reservoir of 914 km², a power plant, transmission lines, workers camp and access roads inside the property. Due to late submission of the SEA, its review was not possible at the time of writing this report. However, it is critical to note that the State Party has affirmed that the project is going ahead, effectively making the SEA meaningless. Recalling Article 6.3 of the *Convention*, it is also very regrettable that the State Party of Egypt is supporting this project.

The independent review of the RHPP EIA concludes that it does not meet acceptable standards, that it does not provide a credible assessment of the potential impacts on the property's OUV, and that its conclusions are untenable based on evidence provided. In addition to the EIA review, various international experts and studies have questioned the economic viability of the RHPP and have pointed to other cost-effective and sustainable alternatives for Tanzania to achieve its legitimate energy objectives.

It is of significant concern that the logging within the future reservoir area has started. Contrary to the Committee's request to the State Party to refrain from any logging (**42 COM 7A.56**), satellite images between January and March 2019 reveal that at least 2,500 ha of forest have already been cleared. At its 42nd session, the Committee had noted that the planned large-scale deforestation represents a clear potential danger to the property and decided to add this issue to the justification for the continued inclusion of the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger. Deforestation of almost 1,000 km² within the property is likely to lead to irreversible damage to its OUV and would hence fulfill the conditions for deleting the property from the World Heritage List, in accordance with Paragraph 192 of the *Operational Guidelines*, especially when combined with the other stressors resulting from RHPP.

Under these conditions, it is of significant concern that the State Party postponed the requested Reactive Monitoring mission to the property. It is therefore recommended that the Committee urge again the State Party to immediately halt all logging operations and to invite the joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission without further delay to verify the extent of the damage and assess the state of conservation of the property, with a view to reviewing whether the conditions of deleting the property from the World Heritage List are met. Given the risk of losing the property's OUV, it is recommended that the Committee decide to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism to this property.

As requested by the Committee, the revised EIA for Kidunda Dam should be made available to review the impacts and mitigation measures with respect to the OUV. It is noted that the 2016 EIA for the Kito-1 oil and gas exploration project will be augmented with a study on the hydrological regime of the Kilombero floodplain and a specific assessment of potential downstream impacts on the OUV of the property, as requested by the Committee (**42 COM 7A.56**).

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.16

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,
2. Recalling Decisions **36 COM 7B.5**, **36 COM 8B.43**, **40 COM 7**, **40 COM 7A.47**, and **42 COM 7A.56** adopted at its 36th (Saint-Petersburg, 2012), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 42nd (Manama, 2018) sessions respectively,
3. While noting the reported reduction in poaching in the property, reiterates its utmost concern about the State Party's decision to develop the Rufiji Hydropower project (RHPP) within the property and recalls the Committee's position that the construction of dams with large reservoirs within the boundaries of World Heritage properties is incompatible with their World Heritage status, and the State Party's commitment as part of the boundary modification in 2012 to not undertake any development activities within the property without prior approval of the Committee;
4. Takes note of the conclusions of the independent expert review of the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) of the RHPP that the EIA falls considerably short of acceptable standards and that it does not provide a credible assessment of the potential impacts on the property's Outstanding Universal Value (OUV);
5. Expresses its utmost concern about reports, confirmed by satellite image analysis, that the logging of 91,400 ha of forests of the future dam area has started, and strongly urges the State Party to immediately halt all logging operations in the property, and all other activities related to the RHPP that will affect the property's OUV and will be difficult to reverse, and reiterates its request to the State Party to consider alternative options to meet its power generation needs;
6. Considers that the deforestation of such a large area within the property would likely lead to irreversible damage to its OUV and hence fulfill the conditions for deletion from the World Heritage List, in accordance with Paragraph 192 of the Operational Guidelines;
7. Also expresses its utmost concern that the State Party has started the works on the RHPP prior to the completion of a Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) undertaken to the highest international standards, and its review by IUCN, and without the approval of this project by the Committee in line with previous commitments made by the State Party;
8. Also strongly urges the State Party to invite the requested joint World Heritage Centre/IUCN Reactive Monitoring mission to the property without further delay to review the status of the RHPP, to verify the extent of the damage already incurred, and to assess the state of conservation of the property, with a view to reviewing whether the conditions for deleting the property from the World Heritage List are met;
9. **Decides therefore to apply the Reinforced Monitoring Mechanism to the property;**
10. Referring to the Preamble of the World Heritage Convention, which considers that "deterioration or disappearance of any item of the cultural or natural heritage constitutes a harmful impoverishment of the heritage of all the nations of the world", and to Article 6.3 of the Convention, also regrets the support provided by the State Party of Egypt to the RHPP, which may cause irreversible damage to the property and its OUV, and reminds all States Parties and private investors not to support projects that may damage World Heritage properties;

11. Notes with concern the submission of the updated hydrology report for the Kidunda Dam, which indicates possible inundation of the property, and also reiterates its request to the State Party to submit as soon as possible to the World Heritage Centre the revised EIA for the project;
12. Notes that the 2016 EIA for the Kito-1 oil and gas exploration project proposed within the Kilombero Valley Ramsar site adjacent to the property will be augmented with the requested study on the hydrological regime of the Kilombero floodplain and a specific assessment of potential downstream impacts on the OUV of the property;
13. Requests the State Party to submit the results of the 2018 aerial wildlife survey as soon as possible, and to develop a population model to estimate the recovery of the elephant population, assuming poaching has been reduced drastically;
14. Finally requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020;
15. Also decides to retain Selous Game Reserve (United Republic of Tanzania) on the **List of World Heritage in Danger**.

CULTURAL PROPERTIES

ARAB STATES

21. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of Iraq

Current conservation issues

The conflict between 2014 and 2017 has led to a massive humanitarian crisis and resulted in significant damage to Iraq's cultural heritage through deliberate destruction, illegal excavation and looting, as well as collateral damage. Three of Iraq's World Heritage sites have suffered as a result of this conflict, namely Samarra Archaeological City, Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) and Hatra. In addition, the archaeological sites of Nimrud and the Ancient City of Nineveh, which are on Iraq's Tentative List, have also been greatly damaged through acts of deliberate destruction. In the Old City of Mosul, included in the Tentative List since August 2018, significant sites, monuments and buildings have been systematically targeted, including historical and religious heritage sites such as al-Nouri Mosque and its iconic al-Hadba Minaret.

On 11 February 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, available at http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/43com/documents/#state_of_conservation_reports. The report provides an overview of damages to the three properties, Samarra Archaeological City, Ashur (Qal'at Sherqat) and Hatra. It also mentions efforts and challenges faced in the recovery of destroyed sites and in the restitution of cultural property. Challenges are related primarily to insufficient funding and the fragile security situation; no physical interventions have yet taken place.

The State Party is of the opinion that conservation interventions can now be considered, due to the current encouraging security situation. The State Party requests that missions be undertaken to conduct damage assessments and conservation works.

Activities undertaken by UNESCO

- At the International Conference for the Reconstruction of Iraq, held in Kuwait City on 14 February 2018, the Director-General of UNESCO launched the initiative "Revive the Spirit of Mosul". Supported by the Prime Minister of Iraq and the Secretary-General of the United Nations, through this flagship initiative and with an approach that fosters harmonious coexistence and the construction of an inclusive, cohesive and equitable society, UNESCO is working with the Government of Iraq in the recovery and reconstruction of the Old City of Mosul's built heritage and in reviving the city's cultural life and educational institutions. In April 2018, the United Arab Emirates and UNESCO signed a USD 50.4 million partnership agreement, aiming at the restoration and reconstruction of the historic landmarks of Mosul, notably the emblematic al-Nouri Mosque and its celebrated al-Hadba Minaret, built more than 840 years ago;
- Since the 42nd session of the World Heritage Committee (Manama, 2018), UNESCO has pursued its actions towards the recovery of Iraq's cultural heritage, notably in Mosul;
- On 10 September 2018, the International Meeting on the Recovery and Rehabilitation of the City of Mosul was held at the UNESCO Headquarters in Paris, in collaboration with the Government of Iraq. The meeting aimed at taking stock of the situation in Mosul, presenting a list of projects that will contribute to the rehabilitation of Mosul's heritage sites, reviving its cultural life and its educational institutions, and raising awareness about the rationale for the initiative "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" spearheaded by UNESCO. The meeting also demonstrated the solidarity of the international community with the Government of Iraq, and its support for a sustainable response to the most urgent needs of the city;
- The rehabilitation and reconstruction of the al-Nouri Mosque and its al-Hadba Minaret, in addition to two churches in the Old City of Mosul, began with preliminary scientific studies and surveys, background studies, data collection and digital documentation, as well as damage assessment. A temporary protective fence around the area of the mosque has been installed. In an area that

is still highly congested with explosives and debris, this will ensure the safety of the public, workers and UNESCO staff during subsequent phases of clearance and site rehabilitation works;

- The structural consolidation of both the al-Nouri Mosque and al-Hadba Minaret is currently ongoing. In addition, UNESCO is engaging with all levels of involved national and local government entities and relevant stakeholders with a view to completing the heritage-sensitive removal of rubble and clearance of explosive hazards at the sites;
- With regard to the support for the restoration and documentation of the thousands of manuscripts dating from the 14th to the 19th centuries, UNESCO provided technical assistance for the preservation of some of the most historically significant manuscripts and materials. The digitization and conservation equipment was subsequently delivered and installed at the Digital Centre of Eastern Manuscripts in Erbil;
- An important project funded by the European Union for more than USD 22 million was signed between it and UNESCO in February 2019. The project aims to rehabilitate the old cities of Mosul and Basra, while creating jobs and developing the skills of vulnerable young people in the rehabilitation of the urban infrastructure of those two cities.

Activities undertaken by the Advisory Bodies

- Representatives of ICOMOS participated in meetings concerning Mosul and provided advice for the Najaf Charter for the Conservation, Restoration and Rehabilitation of Historic Cities, Urban Areas and Historic – Heritage Monuments that aims to preserve the heritage of Najaf and all other Iraqi cities.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The conflict situation in Iraq has directly affected three of its properties that are currently on the List of World Heritage in Danger, and some of its Tentative List properties in varying degrees. Due to the unstable security situation in several parts of the country and the very limited resources, Iraq's other World Heritage and Tentative List properties have been indirectly affected. In addition, the illegal excavation and looting of archaeological sites has caused extensive loss and irreversible damage – although there have been several incidents of restitution of cultural property during the past years.

Since the liberation of vast areas of the country in 2017, Iraq has been facing the challenges of recovery while addressing the unprecedented humanitarian crisis. This is particularly evident at the Old City of Mosul, where UNESCO is currently engaged within the framework of its flagship initiative "Revive the Spirit of Mosul".

During the conference held in April 2019 on the occasion of the 20th anniversary of the 1999 Second Protocol to the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict, the representative of Iraq indicated his country's intention to ratify the Second Protocol, which is a commendable step that would contribute to the enhanced protection of cultural heritage.

On the other hand, the lack of detailed damage assessments for the three World Heritage properties that are on the List of World Heritage in Danger remains a concern. In 2016, the UNESCO Office for Iraq, in collaboration with the State Board of Antiquities and Heritage (SBAH), had carried out documentation and damage assessment of specific monuments at the property of Samarra Archaeological City, as well as preliminary assessments at Nimrud and the Ancient City of Nineveh, which are on the Tentative List.

Nevertheless, detailed damage assessments are necessary to evaluate the situation and to plan for stabilization and conservation works before interventions can take place. It is also necessary to evaluate potential risks other than those specifically related to conflict, such as those concerning natural deterioration and potential flooding, and, to plan for the properties' longer-term recovery and management.

It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to submit documentation on all damage incurred at World Heritage properties, and to undertake protection and urgent stabilization work only in cases where collapse or further damage is imminent, according to the principle of minimal intervention. Elements found at the property, and resulting from conflict-related damages, should be retrieved and gathered in a safe location. Boundaries of properties should be protected from illegal excavations and looting.

It is also recommended that the Committee request the State Party to revisit the Response Plan for the Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Liberated Areas of Iraq (2017-2019), which reflects the recommendations of the International Coordination Conference for the Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Liberated Areas of Iraq, with the objective of finding the way forward to start implementing the priority actions and to secure the needed resources as urgently as possible.

It is further recommended that the Committee remind the State Party to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, about any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of World Heritage properties, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse.

The Committee may wish to reiterate its appeal to Member States to cooperate in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural property coming from Iraq and to contribute towards the safeguarding of its cultural heritage.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.21

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,
2. Taking note of the report provided by the State Party regarding the state of conservation of the properties on the List of World Heritage in Danger, expresses its concern about the lack of comprehensive and detailed assessment of the properties affected by the conflict and about the limited resources available for the safeguarding of affected cultural heritage;
3. Expresses its appreciation to the Director-General of UNESCO for the progress made towards safeguarding of cultural heritage in the Old City of Mosul, and for the expertise and resources mobilized so far within UNESCO's "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" flagship initiative;
4. Requests the State Party to submit updated documentation of damage incurred at World Heritage properties, to safeguard damaged properties according to the principle of minimal intervention, and to refrain from undertaking conservation and restoration work until comprehensive conservation plans have been developed, in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;
5. Also requests the State Party to revisit and address the priority actions outlined in the Response Plan for the Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Liberated Areas of Iraq (2017-2019), with the support of UNESCO and the international community;
6. Reminds the State Party about the need to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, information on any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of World Heritage properties, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;
7. Reiterates its appeal to all Member States of UNESCO to cooperate in the fight against the illicit trafficking of cultural heritage coming from Iraq as per the United Nations Security Council Resolutions 2199 of February 2015, 2253 of December 2015 and 2347 of March 2017, and encourages the State Party to ratify the Second Protocol (1999) to the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;

8. *Calls again* on all Member States of UNESCO to provide technical and financial support to safeguarding efforts for Iraq's cultural heritage, including through the "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" flagship initiative, in order to implement short-, medium- and long-term measures;
9. *Also requests* the World Heritage Centre to present at its 44th session in 2020 a report on the activities undertaken within the framework of the "Revive the Spirit of Mosul" flagship initiative;
10. *Further requests* the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the properties and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.

22. Old City of Jerusalem and its Walls (site proposed by Jordan) (C 148 rev)

See Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.3

25. Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) (C 184)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (iii)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified
Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 0
Total amount approved: USD 0
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
Total amount granted: USD 25,000 for the European Project "Protection of Cultural Heritage and Diversity in Complex Emergencies for Peace and Stability"

Previous monitoring missions
March 2003: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Conflict situation prevailing in the country
- Excessive vegetation growth
- Natural Degradation
- Urban encroachment
- Impact of humidity and seawater salt on stone masonry

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/>

Current conservation issues

On 8 February 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report. An executive summary of this report is available at <https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/184/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- Several elements suffered minor damage in 2017 due to the armed conflict and the use of firearms within the property, the most prominent being the visual scarring of some parts of the Theatre. An agreement has recently been reached with a Spanish institution to restore the Theatre and to assess the damage to the mosaic floors at the property. The Department of Antiquities (DoA) has also been in contact with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) regarding the future restoration work of key elements of the property. The UNDP has already provided support in assessing the required technical and financial support for the restoration of the main entrance to the property, the Punic museum, the Theatre and the storage house;
- The DoA is in the process of securing funding and technical support from the international community and other specialized institutions to help address the ongoing natural degradation of the original building materials;
- The State Party continues its year-round efforts to control vegetation growth. An area around the Rome Theatre has recently been cleared, and work is underway to clear the area around the mausoleums to help limit damage to the floor mosaics and monuments;
- The DoA has participated in the “Training in Action” programme for capacity building in fields such as preventive conservation, management, recording and documentation;
- The boundary clarification adopted in 2018 has been shared with the Municipality of Sabratha and the Urban Planning Authority for protection and conservation purposes. A proposal for a boundary modification has been submitted to the World Heritage Centre for evaluation by the Advisory Bodies.

The State Party intends to call on the international community to provide more financial and technical support for the conservation of its cultural heritage, and has formally invited a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the state of conservation of the property.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment to the conservation of the property despite the prevailing conflict and the lack of funds.

The damages incurred at the property due to the armed conflict, in conjunction with the difficulties to improve the situation and undertake appropriate protection and conservation measures, are of great concern. The property needs a comprehensive strategy for its management and conservation in order to better address the effects of the armed conflict, vandalism, urban encroachment, weathering (humidity, salt, seawater), decay of original materials and vegetation growth, among others.

The boundary clarification of the property adopted by the Committee in 2018 is recognized as an indispensable step towards its protection and management. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS in defining an appropriate buffer zone is highly appreciated, particularly to address the urban encroachment issue. It is recommended that the Committee reiterate its appeal to the State Party to continue this cooperation, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

The efforts made by the State Party in fundraising and the technical cooperation agreements with other States Parties and United Nations agencies are much welcomed, but more support is needed. It is

therefore recommended that the Committee call for the support of the international community for the conservation and protection of the property.

On the occasion of the third cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise, the State Party indicated its willingness to initiate the elaboration of management plans for its all five World Heritage properties, and will seek international support to achieve this objective. It also reported an increasing awareness by civil society, local and national authorities, and high-level decision-makers about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including World Heritage properties. The organization of workshops and symposiums on the state of conservation of the World Heritage properties has emphasized the importance of their protection and conservation, linking national identity with cultural heritage.

It is recommended that the State Party's important efforts for conserve the property are oriented in line with the action plan that was developed during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage, held in Tunis in May 2016 (report available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>), and building on the short-, medium- and long-term measures identified during the meeting.

The recent escalation of violence raises much concern about the sustainability of the efforts made to conserve the property, as it prevents the State Party from undertaking the necessary actions to ensure its protection and conservation. It remains essential that the joint mission invited by the State Party and requested by the Committee at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions are undertaken as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursues its efforts to keep the Committee, through the World Heritage Centre, updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

Considering the above-mentioned information, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.25

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,*
2. *Recalling Decision **42 COM 7A.24**, adopted at its 42nd session (Manama, 2018),*
3. *Notes with appreciation the activities undertaken by the State Party to address the conservation threats at the property despite the numerous difficulties faced, and urges it to continue its efforts in this regard to the extent possible;*
4. *Expresses concern over the damage incurred at the property due to the armed conflict, in particular to the Theatre, and requests the State Party to provide the results of the assessment and documentation of the damage;*
5. *Recognizing the technical and financial difficulties that impede appropriate protection and conservation measures, also requests the State Party to provide detailed information on the measures undertaken to address urban encroachment and the degradation of original building material, as well as any new measures undertaken to ensure the protection and conservation of the property;*
6. *Further requests the State Party to keep the Committee regularly informed of the evolution of the situation at the property and to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, on any ongoing and future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;*

7. Encourages the State Party to continue the finalization of the Minor Boundary Modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;
8. Acknowledges the invitation from the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, to take place as soon as the security conditions permit;
9. Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, to implement the short-, medium- and long-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016);
10. Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020;
11. **Decides to retain the Archaeological Site of Sabratha (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**

26. Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) (C 362)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1986

Criteria (v)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger
Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger
Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified
Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures
Not yet established

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/documents/>

International Assistance
Requests approved: 0
Total amount approved: USD 0
For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds
N/A

Previous monitoring missions
January 1998: UNESCO mission; March 2003: World Heritage Centre mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Conflict situation prevailing in the country

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/>

Current conservation issues

On 8 February 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report. An executive summary of this report is available at <https://whc.unesco.org/en/list/362/documents/>. Progress in a number of conservation issues addressed by the Committee at its previous sessions is presented in this report, as follows:

- The necessary measures for the maintenance and restoration of buildings damaged during the heavy rains of 2017 have been established, including the preparation of a bill of quantities for each building and the financial support of 800,000 Libyan Dinars (USD 570,000) from the Libyan Government for urgent maintenance works. Several contracts have been signed with specialized companies to carry out maintenance and restoration work, which is planned to be completed by autumn 2019. Based on the opinions of local maintenance experts and CRAterre, however, it was not possible to manufacture mud bricks or construct with them during the past autumn;
- Several activities have been carried out in close coordination with the local community, which is committed to the conservation of the property and has invested in the actions undertaken. House owners within the property are aware of its historical and cultural importance, and contribute to its conservation;
- Other activities include the documentation of the entire city's heritage according to specific criteria, as well as the design of an open Geographic Information System (GIS) for the documentation, inventory and presentation of the property. The Ghadamès City Promotion and Development Authority has made arrangements for the presentation and marketing of the property. The designation of the historic Tilouan School as a tourist information centre helped achieve this objective. Further developments include the adoption of a land use regulation plan within the property and the proposed buffer zone, and the preparation of a risk preparedness plan;
- The boundary clarification adopted in 2018 has been shared with the Municipality of Ghadamès, the Ghadamès City Promotion and Development Authority and the Urban Planning Authority for protection and conservation purposes;
- The Department of Antiquities (DoA) has participated in the "Training in Action" programme for capacity building in fields such as preventive conservation, management, recording and documentation.

There have been no security violations or specific threat to the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, therefore the State Party requests the Committee to remove the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger. To this end, the State Party has formally invited a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to assess the state of conservation of the property.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The information provided by the State Party demonstrates its commitment to the conservation of the property, despite the prevailing conflict. Progress is being made regarding the analysis of the situation at the property. The allocation of funds for emergency maintenance works and the efforts being made by the State Party to elaborate regulatory and management tools, such as the risk preparedness plan, are welcomed. The State Party should consider an International Assistance request in order to address the necessary planning and implementation of comprehensive conservation and restoration actions that would ensure the property's integrity and authenticity.

Detailed information on the ongoing conservation and restoration works has not been submitted, nor has any information been received by the World Heritage Centre on the development of land use within the boundaries of property and the proposed buffer zone. Information about these and any other plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property needs to be submitted to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

The commitment and interest of the local communities and owners in maintaining and conserving the property is welcomed. It is recommended that the Committee encourage them to continue their efforts

to maintain its OUV and to prepare a management plan for the property following the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL).

The effort made to clarify the property's boundary is recognized as an indispensable step towards its effective protection and management. The ongoing close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and ICOMOS concerning the definition of an appropriate buffer zone is appreciated. It is recommended that the Committee reiterate its appeal to the State Party to continue this cooperation, in line with Paragraph 164 of the *Operational Guidelines*.

With the commencement of the third cycle of the Periodic Reporting exercise, the State Party has expressed its willingness to initiate the elaboration of management plans for all five of its World Heritage properties, and will seek international support to achieve this objective. It also reported on the increasing awareness by civil society, local and national authorities, and high-level decision-makers about the necessity to protect cultural heritage in Libya, including World Heritage properties. The organization of workshops and symposiums on the state of conservation of the World Heritage properties has emphasized the importance of their protection and conservation, linking national identity with cultural heritage.

It is recommended that the State Party continue to orient the important efforts made in conserving the property in line with the strategy developed during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage, held in Tunis in May 2016 (report available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/news/1496>), building on the short-, medium- and long-term measures identified during that meeting.

The recent escalation of violence raises much concern about the sustainability of the efforts made to conserve the Old Town of Ghadamès, as the situation prevents the State Party from undertaking necessary actions to protect and conserve the property. It remains essential that the joint mission invited by the State Party and requested by the Committee at its 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016) and 41st (Krakow, 2017) sessions takes place as soon as the security conditions permit. In the meantime, it is important that the State Party pursues its efforts to keep the Committee, through the World Heritage Centre, updated on the situation on the ground, as well as on the further implementation of the measures it has launched, while addressing, to the extent possible, the comments and requests made by the Committee.

It is recommended that the Committee call upon the international community to support the State Party in its conservation efforts.

Considering the above-mentioned information, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.26

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,*
2. *Recalling Decision **42 COM 7A.25**, adopted at its 42nd session (Manama, 2018),*
3. *Commends the State Party for its important efforts in conserving the property and its Outstanding Universal Value (OUV), in close coordination with the local communities and civil society, and urges it to continue its efforts in this regard to the extent possible;*
4. *Requests the State Party, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, to keep the Committee regularly informed about the evolution of the situation at the property and to inform it, through the World Heritage Centre, of any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects that may affect the OUV of the property, including the conservation and restoration works at buildings affected by the heavy rains of 2017, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;*
5. *Encourages the State Party to submit an International Assistance request in order to address the necessary planning and implementation for comprehensive conservation*

and restoration actions to ensure the property's integrity and authenticity including the completion and adoption of the management plan in line with the approach of 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL);

6. *Also encourages the State Party to continue the finalization of the Minor Boundary Modification in close consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, in line with Paragraph 164 of the Operational Guidelines;*
7. *Acknowledges the invitation from the State Party for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to the property, and further encourages it to take place as soon as the security conditions permit;*
8. *Calls for an increased mobilization of the international community to provide financial and technical support to the State Party to implement the short-, medium- and long-term measures identified during the International Meeting on the Safeguard of Libyan Cultural Heritage (Tunis, May 2016);*
9. *Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020;*
10. ***Decides to retain the Old Town of Ghadamès (Libya) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

29. Hebron/AI-Khalil Old Town (Palestine) (C 1565)

See Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.3

37. General Decision on the World Heritage properties of the Syrian Arab Republic

Current conservation issues

The armed conflict in Syria started in March 2011 and has constantly escalated leading to significant violence and degradation of humanitarian conditions. It has inflicted damage on the inscribed properties as well as on the 12 sites inscribed on the Tentative List. Sites have been damaged by shelling, fires, extensive illegal excavations, military use, construction violations, in addition to intentional destructions and inappropriate use of archaeological sites by internally displaced populations. Some sites are still at risk, due to the conflict.

On 8 January 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, available at http://whc.unesco.org/en/sessions/43COM/documents/#state_of_conservation_reports. This report represents an official statement of the Syrian authorities and collates available information from the branches of the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) up to 31 December 2018. In some areas, access to heritage sites is extremely limited. In particular, the site of the Ancient Villages of Northern Syria remains inaccessible, which does not allow a full understanding of the extent of damage at this property.

The State Party reported on actions carried out by the DGAM, despite the difficult working conditions. These comprise monitoring World Heritage properties and cultural heritage in general, assessing damages, undertaking emergency conservation and risk mitigation actions whenever possible, and preparing inventories of the built and movable heritage. The report also stressed the extreme financial

difficulties faced by DGAM in its efforts for the preservation of cultural heritage and the restricted international funding to support these efforts.

Updated information on the conservation of sites inscribed on the Tentative List was also provided in the report, indicating the following:

- The site of the 'Arwad Island' is subject to tourism development pressures, with an extensive project planned on an area of 7 acres belonging to the Ministry of Tourism;
- At the site of the 'Noreas of Hama', the Directorate of Wheels and the DGAM carried out maintenance works on the wooden wheels and consolidation works on the stone structures, despite the lack of adequate material and skilled labor given that huge levers are needed for the works;
- In 'Maaloula', following the restoration works carried out by the Municipality and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) on infrastructures, residential houses and on the Monastery of Mar Takla, 35% of the inhabitants have returned to the site;
- In 'Ugarit (Tell Shamra)' the national archaeological mission has been clearing the site from vegetation growth and has carried out maintenance works on the site's infrastructure;
- In 'Tartus: the Crusaders Citadel-City', the DGAM has carried out maintenance works;
- Access to 'Apamea (Afamia)' is still limited, however the DGAM has documented damages at the site, including thousands of illegal excavation holes, using drone technology;
- The site of 'Ebla' is still inaccessible. Local communities informed the DGAM that the Museum of Idlib, which hosted the "archives of Ebla", has been extensively looted;
- The sites of 'Mari (Tell Hariri) and Dura Europos' are still inaccessible, and no new information is reported;
- No further damage is reported at the sites of 'Qasr al-Hayr ach-Charqi, a desert Castle' and 'Raqqa-Rafiq: the Abassid City'.

Activities undertaken by UNESCO

- Since the 42nd session of the Committee (Manama, 2018), UNESCO has pursued its actions to assist the State Party in its continuous and sustained efforts to safeguard cultural heritage;
- At the international level, UNESCO continues to raise awareness of the international community on the destruction of cultural heritage in Syria, in the framework of the implementation of the United Nations Security Council (UNSC) Resolution 2199 (February 2015) and Resolution 2347 (March 2017) recognizing for the first time the importance of heritage protection for peace and security;
- At the national level, UNESCO has pursued its activities to monitor the situation of Syrian cultural heritage, raise awareness on its protection, undertake actions to safeguard it, and coordinate the work of national and international entities working on its safeguarding;
- In the framework of the European Union-funded project "Emergency Safeguarding of Syrian Cultural Heritage" (2.46 million euros), co-financed by Flanders and Austria, and implemented in partnership with ICOMOS and ICCROM (March 2014 – December 2018), the following activities were undertaken:
 - A 52-minute documentary entitled "Stonekeepers", in Arabic, English and French, was produced and will soon be distributed,
 - In July 2018 in Brussels, an awareness-raising event was organized to launch a publication on Syrian Traditional Music,
 - From 22 to 27 June 2018 at the Matenadaran in Yerevan (Armenia), a training on the conservation and restoration of Syrian manuscripts and archival documents was organized;

- The UNESCO-UNITAR joint publication “Five years of Conflict: the State of Cultural Heritage in the Ancient City of Aleppo” was launched in November 2018 and is available at <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000265826?locale=fr>. It is being translated into Arabic and French. Another publication on the state of World Heritage properties in Syria and at sites inscribed on the Syrian Tentative List is under preparation;
- Two international assistance requests have been approved, one for the Ancient City of Bosra (21 December 2018 under the emergency World Heritage Fund) and one for the Crac des Chevaliers and Qal'at Salah El-Dine (6 February 2019);
- An Italian Funds-in-Trust project entitled “Reinforcing Cultural Heritage Protection in Syria, and in the Ancient City of Bosra in particular as a follow up to the World Heritage Committee Decisions” (200 000 euros) has been endorsed by the Syrian Authorities. The project will allow the provision of further technical support to World Heritage properties.

Activities undertaken by the Advisory Bodies

Members of the ICOMOS Working Group on the Safeguarding of Cultural Heritage in Syria and Iraq took part in a colloquium on the destruction of Syrian archaeological heritage in Paris and were invited by the Syrian Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums to participate in a workshop entitled “Developing the National Strategy for the restoration of the old city of Aleppo”. Through its Project Anqa, which was run in cooperation with Cyark, and funded by the Arcadia Foundation, and which concluded in 2019, ICOMOS contributed to the 3D recording of seven at-risk heritage sites in Damascus and to the capacity building of Syrian professionals;

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The situation of armed conflict in Syria has affected the six World Heritage properties and has substantially limited capacities to adequately sustain and protect their Outstanding Universal Value. The properties have been increasingly threatened by ascertained and potential dangers, in particular the Ancient City of Aleppo, which has been extensively and increasingly destroyed, and which runs the risk of further irreversible destruction during the challenging recovery phase.

Illegal excavations across archaeological sites and tells in Syria are causing extensive and irreversible damage to those sites, many of which are on Syria’s Tentative List. They are also a major source for the illicit trafficking of cultural property, providing looted artifacts to be sold in regional and international black markets.

It is recommended that the Committee commend the DGAM, heritage professionals in Syria and local communities who have made sustained efforts to protect cultural heritage, to monitor it closely and to implement first aid measures for its safeguarding, despite the very difficult situation.

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies will continue to support the State Party in the identification of the necessary corrective measures and in the development of Desired state of Conservation statements for the removal of the properties from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), for all six properties, as soon as the situation allows.

It is important that humanitarian and security related actions be carried out in coordination with cultural heritage stakeholders, to avoid further irreversible damages to the properties, and allow for undertaking first aid measures for its cultural heritage. Furthermore, it is recommended that systematic documentation of all damage incurred at World Heritage properties be duly pursued, whenever the situation allows, and that the Committee reiterate its call to the State Party to safeguard damaged properties through minimal first aid interventions to prevent theft, further collapse and natural degradation, and to refrain from undertaking other measures until the situation allows for the development of a comprehensive strategy and action plan that respond to international standards and high-quality scientific methods.

With regard to post-conflict interventions, it is recommended that the Committee call on the State Party to plan the future of the World Heritage properties according to international conservation charters and standards, in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies.

It is recommended that the Committee also call for international and national heritage professionals to continue to unite for the safeguarding of Syria’s cultural heritage; and to further support its safeguarding through earmarked funds and contributions to the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund.

Until conditions improve, it is recommended that the Committee urge all parties associated with the conflict in Syria to refrain from any action that could further damage the heritage of the country, in particular all World Heritage properties and sites included on the Tentative List, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, especially the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, in part by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage and preventing any damage that may result from targeting World Heritage properties.

It is also recommended that the Committee reiterate its suggestion that the State Party consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict.

It is further recommended that the Committee also call upon all parties associated with the conflict in Syria and the international community, in particular the neighboring countries to Syria, to ensure effective measures for the fight against illicit trafficking of cultural objects, in line with the UN Security Council Resolution 2199.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.37

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,*
2. *Recalling Decision **42 COM 7A.36**, adopted at its 42nd session (Manama, 2018),*
3. *Deplores the conflict situation prevailing in the country, the loss of human life and the degradation of humanitarian conditions;*
4. *Taking note of the report provided by the State Party regarding the state of conservation of the six Syrian World Heritage properties and the sites inscribed on the Syrian Tentative List, commends the Directorate General of Antiquities and Museums (DGAM) and all heritage professionals and local communities in Syria who are working on monitoring and protecting cultural heritage, for their sustained efforts amidst extremely difficult conditions, but expresses its utmost concern about the damages incurred and the threats facing these properties and cultural heritage in general;*
5. *Urges again all parties associated with the situation in Syria to refrain from any action that would cause further damage to the country's cultural heritage, and to fulfil their obligations under international law, in particular the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, including preventing any damage that may results from targeting World Heritage properties, sites included in the Tentative List and other cultural heritage sites;*
6. *Also urges the State Party and the international community to include recovery actions of cultural heritage properties within the overall humanitarian, security and peace building response;*
7. *Further urges the State Party to safeguard damaged properties through minimal first aid interventions to prevent theft, further collapse and natural degradation, and to refrain from undertaking conservation and restoration work until the situation allows for the development of comprehensive conservation strategies and actions that respond to international standards, in full consultation with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies;*
8. *Reiterates its appeal to all Member States of UNESCO to cooperate in fighting against the illicit trafficking of cultural property coming from Syria as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2199 of February 2015, and, in engaging in the protection*

of cultural heritage during armed conflict as per the United Nations Security Council Resolution 2347 of March 2017, and reiterates its suggestion to the State Party to consider ratifying the Second Protocol (1999) of the 1954 Hague Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict;

9. Requests the State Party to pursue the systematic documentation of all damage incurred at World Heritage properties, whenever conditions allow, to implement all possible risk mitigation measures, and to inform on the development of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the properties from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR) and the identification of corrective measures for all six properties;
10. Reminds the State Party about the need to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, information on any future plans for major restoration or new construction projects, including infrastructure development projects, that may affect the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of World Heritage properties, in conformity with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, before making any decisions that would be difficult to reverse;
11. Reiterates its call upon the international community to further support the safeguarding of Syrian cultural heritage through earmarked funds or through contributions to the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund;
12. Also reiterates its call upon the international and national cultural heritage professionals to unite for the safeguarding of Syria's cultural heritage, and to pursue their ongoing initiatives in coordination with UNESCO;
13. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the properties and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020.

38. Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) (C 611)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1993

Criteria (ii)(iv)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2000-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Serious deterioration of the built heritage (a high percentage of the residential houses being replaced by concrete and multi-storey buildings);
- The remaining houses in the city are rapidly deteriorating, due to the prevailing low income of the inhabitants;
- Since the souq activities have been transferred outside the city, the ancient souq is almost empty and free from any type of activity and the shops are falling apart;
- The traditional economic role of the city has vanished;
- The city in general, is lacking any conservation and rehabilitation strategies;
- Threats arising from the armed conflict in Yemen.

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Adopted, see page <https://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4357>

Corrective measures identified

Adopted; see page <https://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/1282>

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Identified; see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/decisions/4357>

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 9 (from 1994-2014)

Total amount approved: USD 188,997

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: USD 14,000 from the Italian Funds-in-Trust and the France-UNESCO Co-operation Agreement

Total amount granted to Yemeni cultural properties: USD 194,836 from the European Union for damage assessments, capacity development and emergency stabilization of damaged buildings and protection of archaeological sites

Total amount of USD 35,000 from UNESCO Regular Programme for the Sustainable Management of Tangible Heritage in the GCC and Yemen

USD 12,000 000 from the European Union for the project: Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen (Sana'a, Shibam, Zabid and Aden)

Previous monitoring missions

2002 and 2003: international expertise; December 2004: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2007: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; January 2009: World Heritage Centre mission; January 2011: Joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Serious degradation of the city's heritage (many houses and the ancient souq are in an alarming state of deterioration)
- Large percentage of the city's houses replaced by inappropriate concrete buildings
- Large sections of the city's open spaces have been privatized, either illegally or informally and more than 30% of these built-up
- Reduction in support and resources arising from political and socio-economic disturbances

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/>

Current conservation issues

On 21 March 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/611/documents/>, and presents the following progress:

- The Historic Town of Zabid continues to face many threats, especially from armed conflict in close proximity to the property. The State Party has expressed particular concern about the bombardment of areas surrounding the property, and groups that might reach the property and cause damage to monuments, despite the efforts of the Ministry of Culture and General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY), and ongoing cooperation with the local council and Zabid communities;
- Owing to the absence of international organizations and the deteriorating economic situation of the country, as well as the unstable security situation, GOPHCY has not been able to take extensive precautionary measures. Some initiatives have occurred, such as paving, improvement and drainage works financed by the Social Fund for Development. Preliminary surveys of damage in the city have been completed by the GOPHCY branch in Zabid. There has been a study of the roofing of the old market (souq), funded by the State Party of Germany, as well as studies on some of the conflict-affected buildings. GOPHCY has also reduced the spread of unauthorized construction and acted to redress previous unauthorized works;
- UNESCO has provided assistance through training programmes for GOPHCY, the General Organization of Antiquities and Museums (GOAM) personnel in Amman, Jordan, and through the Centre for Architectural Training and Studies. It is hoped that future training may further develop

local expertise in technical fields that contribute to preserving historical monuments within the property, and in Yemen generally. Urgent financial assistance is still required for the physical conservation of buildings and, thereby, to support local communities' and post-conflict recovery, which would eventually contribute to the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger;

- Nevertheless, GOPHCY still lacks the basic tools for maintenance activities, and lacks organizational support. There is an ongoing urgent need for the support of the international community, in addition to the efforts of the World Heritage Centre, Advisory Bodies and existing donors;
- The State Party indicates that it would welcome a Reactive Monitoring mission.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The security situation in Yemen, in combination with a lack of organizational support and resources, continues to obstruct both effective heritage management and physical conservation works within the property. However, the efforts of GOPHCY and local communities in training, documentation, damage assessment, first-aid interventions and other conservation initiatives are commendable. The training programmes that have been conducted in Amman, Jordan, and through the Centre for Architectural Training and Studies are also welcome.

The implementation of the European Union funded project "Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen", began in 2019 through the UNESCO Office in Doha, and is expected to continue until 2021. The project will contribute to promoting livelihood opportunities for youth through urban regeneration activities. It comprises the restoration of particular buildings in the World Heritage Properties of Sana'a, Shibam and Zabid that have been damaged during the ongoing conflict. The project will also contribute to social cohesion and peace-building through targeted cultural programming and support for the civil society.

It remains necessary for a Reactive Monitoring mission to visit the property in order to advise on short-term repair works and to assist with the identification of the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), and associated corrective measures and timeframe, as soon as the security situation allows.

In the framework of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting for the Arab States region, information was provided in relation to constructions within the property, without respecting the original materials and building techniques. Construction permits should pass through GOPHCY in order to guarantee compliance with building regulations.

It is recommended that the Committee again urge all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage.

Support from the international community remains essential for ensuring technical and financial resources, and for building capacities in adequate preventive and conservation measures at the property. There is no reported progress in the preparation of a Management Plan, in the finalization of the draft National Strategy for the Preservation of the Historic Cities, Sites and Monuments 2016 – 2020, or in the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015. Prospects for financial and technical support are necessarily constrained until the security situation improves. It might be appropriate for the international community to continue to express its support, and where possible, to offer technical assistance.

Considering the above-mentioned information, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.38

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,

2. Recalling Decision **42 COM 7A.37** adopted at its 42nd session (Manama, 2018),
3. Commends the Ministry of Culture and the General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY), other local actors and the communities of Zabid for their ongoing efforts to document, protect and conserve the property, despite the very difficult conditions, and also commends all parties involved in the training programmes that have been conducted in Jordan and through the Centre for Architectural Training and Studies;
4. Expresses its continuing concern at the damage to the cultural heritage of the Historic Town of Zabid as a result of ongoing armed conflict, and that the property continues to be threatened by the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of organisational support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;
5. Encourages the State Party to continue its collaboration with the UNESCO Doha Office in the implementation of the “Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen” project;
6. Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on short-term repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as soon as the security situation in Yemen has improved;
7. Urges all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property, and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, in particular the safeguarding of properties on the World Heritage List and those included on the Tentative List of Yemen, and also encourages all concerned stakeholders to unite for the preservation of cultural heritage in Yemen;
8. Reiterates its previous calls for the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen’s Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures, and calls on the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to continue to provide technical assistance and support, where possible;
9. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020;
10. Decides to retain Historic Town of Zabid (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

39. Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) (C 385)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1986

Criteria (iv)(v)(vi)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2015-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

Damages and threats related to the armed conflict in Yemen

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 6 (from 1990-2014)

Total amount approved: USD 101,997

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted: 1988: USD 374,800, UNDP/UNESCO project in support of local staff training and fund-raising. 2004-2006: USD 60,000 for the Inventory of the historic city (Italian Funds-in-Trust); USD 12,000 for technical assistance in support of the reconstruction of the al-Qasimi neighborhood (Arab Regional Centre for World Heritage (ARC-WH))

Total amount granted to Yemeni cultural properties: USD 194,836 from the European Union for damage assessments, capacity development and emergency stabilization of damaged buildings and protection of archaeological sites. Total amount of USD 35,000 from UNESCO Regular Programme for the Sustainable Management of Tangible Heritage in the GCC and Yemen. USD 12,000,000 from the European Union for the project: Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen (Shibam, Sana'a, Zabid and Aden).

Previous monitoring missions

1998, 1999, 2003: World Heritage Centre monitoring missions; 2003 to 2005 and 2010: World Heritage Centre and experts missions

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Modern constructions and uncontrolled expansion of commercial activities (issue resolved)
- Lack of a Safeguarding Plan (issue resolved)
- Fly-over bridge project (issue resolved)
- Uncontrolled vertical and horizontal additions
- Management activities (Use of inappropriate building materials and techniques)
- Densification of the historic fabric through occupation of green areas
- Functional decay of the residential neighbourhoods
- Continuing vulnerability of the property, as a result of extreme conditions since 2011
- Threats arising from the armed conflict in Yemen
- Physical damage and instability of buildings
- Urgent need for shelter for displaced residents
- Desertification of green areas and public gardens/orchards
- Problems with the network for the evacuation of rainwater

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/>

Current conservation issues

On 21 March 2019, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/385/documents/>, and presents the following progress:

- The armed conflict in Yemen continues to threaten the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to cause economic and social impact. Although the frequency of air strikes has decreased, the Al-Qassimi, Alfolihi, Madrassa, Al-Bakiria and Bahr Rajraj neighbourhoods remain affected;
- There is little available support or funding to carry out maintenance and conservation actions, nor to establish and implement corrective measures aimed at removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger. Repairs have been carried out in Al-Qasimi, but other areas remain unstable, with buildings in danger of collapse and residents being displaced. The resulting economic and social pressure has resulted in building violations, which are being addressed through demolition orders and education;
- Through the Ministry of Culture, the State Party has supported and involved community and government organizations, including the Tourism Promotion Board and Education Office in campaigns to raise awareness of the importance of cultural heritage. The Ministry of Culture has contributed to the restoration of damaged monuments and buildings through the Heritage and Cultural Development Fund;
- UNESCO and the World Heritage Centre have funded a damage inventory and assessment, undertaken by the Centre for Architectural Training and Studies, in addition to supporting capacity building;
- The review of a heritage protection bylaw will be submitted to the Prime Minister for adoption;
- The High Committee for Old City of Sana'a Protection has been reactivated to raise awareness, seek funds, encourage community participation and monitoring, and safeguard the property. The first national symposium for the preservation of Sana'a heritage took place in July 2018, focusing on sustainable protection and conservation of the old city, on support for the General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY) and on building a common vision for strategies needed to prevent the destruction of Yemeni heritage through cooperation between civil society and the government;
- The State Party requires assistance in ensuring the protection of its heritage, as well as support for institutional and legislative preservation processes, such as guidelines for restoration, construction and rehabilitation, documentation of buildings and spaces, the preparation of the initial phase of a Conservation and Development Plan, and the preparation of a Management Plan for the property.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The security situation in Yemen, in combination with a lack of organizational support and resources, continues to obstruct both effective heritage management and physical conservation works within the property. However, the efforts of the State Party and other international actors, including the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies, to provide training, and technical guidelines are commended. These efforts are contributing to the assessment and restoration of damaged monuments and buildings, as well as to the broader objectives of providing shelter. The State Party and its agencies have undertaken work on inventories, evaluation of damage, and repair and conservation works (although details are lacking). It is positive that there are a range of training and community awareness programmes, despite the challenging circumstances. Nevertheless, damages to the historic fabric and the ongoing displacement of residents create a dire situation within the property.

The property continues to require reconstruction plans that reconcile the provision of housing and services with the need to restore damaged precincts and buildings, based on survey and documentation, and by using traditional techniques and materials. Unregulated new constructions and inadequate restorations incrementally affect the OUV of the property. It is recommended that the Committee request the State Party to continue to consult the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to ensure that works at the property meet basic technical requirements.

The implementation of the European Union funded project Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen began in 2019 through UNESCO Office in Doha, and is expected to continue until 2021. The project will contribute to promoting livelihood opportunities for youth through urban regeneration activities. It comprises the restoration of particular buildings in the World Heritage Properties of Sana'a, Shibam and Zabid that have been damaged during the ongoing conflict. The project will also contribute to social cohesion and peace-building through targeted cultural programming and support for the civil society. This project is very welcome, while recognising that qualified professionals would be needed for the rehabilitation of buildings.

The reactivation of the High Committee for Old City of Sana'a Protection is a positive step, as is the national symposium for the preservation of Sana'a heritage and the resulting re-enforcement of GOPHCY's important role in conservation, training, and communication with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies. However, such exchanges of information need to be backed-up by resources that allow the implementation of physical conservation actions.

In the framework of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting for the Arab States region, information was provided on the issue of desertification owing to the lack of maintenance and water shortage. Buildings were damaged by heavy rains, while problems with the city's collapsed rainwater collection system require urgent attention. Urban pressure has increased in the buffer zone, with constructions that do not respect the original materials and construction techniques. Construction permits should pass through GOPHCY in order to guarantee compliance with regulations.

Owing to the prevailing security conditions, it remains challenging for the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to provide support to the State Party on first-aid measures and in restoration/reconstruction of damaged structures. Currently, it is not possible to arrange the previously-proposed joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, which would aim at assisting the State Party in developing corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR).

The Committee might wish to urge again all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage of Yemen and the OUV of the property, and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage.

Support from the international community remains essential for building capacities in adequate preventive and conservation measures at the property. There is no reported progress in finalizing the draft National Strategy for the Preservation of the Historic Cities, Sites and Monuments 2016 – 2020, nor in the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015. Financial and technical support is necessarily constrained until the security situation improves. However, it might be appropriate for the international community to continue to express its support and, where possible, to offer technical assistance.

Considering the above-mentioned information, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.39

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,*
2. *Recalling Decision **42 COM 7A.38**, adopted at its 42nd session (Manama, 2018),*
3. *Commends the State Party and its agencies, including the General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY) on initiatives undertaken in capacity building, damage assessment, documentation and emergency interventions at the property, and requests that they continue to consult with UNESCO and the Advisory Bodies, and to restore damaged buildings, based on surveys and documentation, using*

traditional construction techniques and materials as much as possible, to avoid incrementally affecting the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property;

4. *Also commends the State Party and its agencies on initiatives undertaken to support and involve community and government organizations, and in campaigns to raise awareness of the importance of cultural heritage;*
5. *Expresses its continuing concern at the damage caused to the cultural heritage of Yemen as a result of armed conflict, and that the Old City of Sana'a has incurred irreversible destruction and continues to be vulnerable, owing to the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;*
6. *Notes the actions taken to address unauthorized construction of new buildings within the property, which incrementally affect the OUV of the property, also requests the State Party to continue to consult the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies in order to ensure that restoration and reconstruction works at the property meet basic technical requirements, and further requests the State Party to submit details for new buildings and new projects to the World Heritage Centre, for examination by the Advisory Bodies, prior to initiating any construction works, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;*
7. *Encourages the State Party to continue its collaboration with the UNESCO Doha Office in the implementation of the Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen project;*
8. *Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as soon as the security situation in Yemen has improved;*
9. *Urges all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage and the OUV of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, in particular the safeguarding of properties on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and also encourages all concerned stakeholders to unite for the preservation of cultural heritage in Yemen;*
10. *Reiterates its previous calls to the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures, and calls on the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to continue providing technical assistance and support where needed;*
11. *Requests furthermore the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020;*
12. ***Decides to retain Old City of Sana'a (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.***

40. Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) (C 192)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 1982

Criteria (iii)(iv)(v)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2015-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Threats from natural elements
- Lack of organizational support and material resources for conservation
- Threats related to the armed conflict

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 6 (from 1982-1999)

Total amount approved: USD 121,966

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

Total amount granted to Yemeni cultural properties: USD 194,836 from the European Union for damage assessments, capacity development and emergency stabilization of damaged buildings and protection of archaeological sites. Total amount of USD 35,000 from UNESCO Regular Programme for the Sustainable Management of Tangible Heritage in the GCC and Yemen. USD 12,000 000 from the European Union for the project: Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen (Sana'a, Shibam, Zabid and Anden).

Previous monitoring missions

N/A

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Floods (issue previously reported as being resolved)
- Poor maintenance (issue previously reported as being resolved)
- Damage to historic buildings
- Reduction in support and resources arising from political and socio-economic disturbances
- Armed conflict situation since 2015
- Threats from rain and floods

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/>

Current conservation issues

On 21 March 2019, the State Party submitted a report on the state of conservation, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/192/documents/> and presents the following progress:

- Despite the deteriorated condition of the property, economic and social constraints, and a lack of external support, the State Party continues intensive efforts to preserve the cultural heritage values of the property. The General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY) has acted quickly within its available resources to stabilize structures affected by floods and armed conflict. However, basic maintenance tools and financial and organizational

support remain lacking. The State Party has also continued to consult with the World Heritage Centre and Advisory Bodies;

- Concern has been expressed that the 'Shibam Oases Development Project' is yet to achieve its stated goals, including addressing the conservation needs of the property and its residents, and, that the State Party has not been involved or consulted during the project implementation;
- The Ministry of Culture has actively consulted with other State Party agencies to appraise them of the problems and difficulties in preserving the cultural heritage of this property and other historic cities inscribed on the World Heritage List. Proposed changes to the heritage protection bylaw have been prepared for submission to the Prime Minister;
- The report '*Conservation Status of Shibam Hadramout 2018 – 2019, Strategy for the Management of the Historic City of Shibam*' has been prepared to provide a management strategy for the property, with regard to its physical condition, and, the political and conflict context in Yemen. GOPHCY has developed a series of plans and programmes, including engagement with local authorities and communities, improved communication with international organizations, implementation of building restoration programmes and workshops, and awareness programmes, bulletins and urgent appeals for rescue and restoration;
- Major projects undertaken include the preparation of a plan for drainage inventory, studies for the repair of flood and conflict-damaged buildings, a study for the restoration and maintenance of the historical palace of Sayoun, and the preparation of a study for a proposed new government complex.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The security situation in Yemen, in combination with the physical circumstances of the property, and lack of organizational support and resources, continues to obstruct effective heritage management and physical conservation works within the property. Support from the international community remains essential for capacity building and for adequate preventive and conservation measures.

The property, built of mud, is located in a flood prone area and remains at severe risk of major damage from natural elements and the effects of armed conflict, unless preventive measures are undertaken. Climate change is likely to exacerbate this problem. Therefore, it is a matter of great concern that the 'Shibam Oases Development Project', part of a sustainable food security programme using the Shibam oases that are regarded as the buffer zone of the property, is considered by the State Party not to meet the needs of the property and its residents and that consultation about the project has been inadequate.

The initiatives undertaken by the State Party and its agencies are commendable. Nevertheless, it would be appropriate to submit to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines, the report on the '*Conservation Status of Shibam Hadramout 2018 – 2019, Strategy for the Management of the Historic City of Shibam*', as well as reports on drainage, flooding, and the restoration and maintenance of the historical palace of Sayoun, in addition to full details regarding the proposed new government complex.

The implementation of the European Union funded project Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen, began in 2019 through the UNESCO Office in Doha, and is expected to continue until 2021. The project will contribute to promoting livelihood opportunities for youth through urban regeneration activities. It comprises the restoration of particular buildings in the World Heritage Properties of Sana'a, Shibam and Zabid that have been damaged during the ongoing conflict. The project will also contribute to social cohesion and peace-building through targeted cultural programming and support for the civil society.

In the framework of the Third Cycle of the Periodic Reporting for the Arab States region, it was indicated that floods and damages to the wall are threatening the state of conservation of the property.

Owing to the prevailing security condition in the country, it remains challenging for the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to provide further support to the State Party on first-aid measures and restoration/reconstruction of damaged structures. Also, it does not seem currently possible to arrange the previously-proposed joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, which would assist the State Party in developing a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR). It is recommended that the Committee urge again all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage

of Yemen and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage.

Support from the international community remains essential for capacity building to conduct adequate preventive and conservation measures at the property. There is no reported progress in finalizing the draft National Strategy for the Preservation of the Historic Cities, Sites and Monuments 2016 – 2020, nor in the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural Heritage, adopted at the UNESCO expert meeting in July 2015. Financial support is necessarily constrained until the security situation improves. However, it would be appropriate for the international community to continue to express its support and where possible to offer technical assistance.

Considering the above-mentioned information, it is recommended that the Committee retain the property on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.40

The World Heritage Committee,

1. *Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,*
2. *Recalling Decision **42 COM 7A.39**, adopted at its 42nd session (Manama, 2018),*
3. *Commends the State Party and the General Organization for the Preservation of Historic Cities in Yemen (GOPHCY), the community and the other concerned stakeholders of Shibam for their efforts to protect and conserve the property and to maintain communication with the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies, despite the very difficult conditions;*
4. *Expresses its continuing concern at the damage caused to the property as a result of natural elements and the ongoing armed conflict, and that the property continues to be vulnerable, owing to the residual impact of previous flooding as well as the current security situation, ongoing social change and continuing lack of organizational support and resources for both heritage management and physical conservation;*
5. *Notes the concerns expressed by the State Party that the 'Shibam Oases Development Project' does not meet the needs of the property and its residents and that consultation about the project has been inadequate, and reiterates its previous request that the State Party submit details of this project to the World Heritage Centre, for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;*
6. *Encourages the State Party to continue its collaboration with the UNESCO Doha Office in the implementation of the "Cash for Work: Promoting Livelihood Opportunities for Urban Youth in Yemen" project;*
7. *Also requests the State Party to also submit the report 'Conservation Status of Shibam Hadramout 2018 – 2019, Strategy for the Management of the Historic City of Shibam', and the reports on drainage, flooding and the restoration and maintenance of the historical palace of Sayoun, as well as full details regarding the proposed new government complex, to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies, in accordance with Paragraph 172 of the Operational Guidelines;*
8. *Reiterates the need for a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission to advise on repair and conservation works, and to contribute to the development of a set of corrective measures and a timeframe for their implementation, as well as the Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger (DSOCR), as soon as the security situation in Yemen has improved;*

9. Urges all parties involved in the conflict to refrain from any further action that would cause damage to the cultural heritage and the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) of the property and to fulfil their obligations under international law by taking all possible measures to protect such heritage, in particular the safeguarding of properties on the World Heritage List and those included in the Tentative List of Yemen, and also encourages all concerned stakeholders to unite for the preservation of cultural heritage in Yemen;
10. Reiterates its previous calls for the international community to provide technical and financial support, including through the UNESCO Heritage Emergency Fund, for the implementation of the Emergency Action Plan for the Safeguarding of Yemen's Cultural heritage, adopted at the UNESCO Expert meeting in July 2015, including funding for capacity building and first-aid restoration and protection measures, and calls on the World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies to continue providing the State Party with technical assistance and support where needed;
11. Requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property and the implementation of the above, for examination by the World Heritage Committee at its 44th session in 2020;
12. **Decides** to retain Old Walled City of Shibam (Yemen) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.

ASIA AND PACIFIC

44. Historic Centre of Shakhrisyabz (Uzbekistan) (C 885)

Year of inscription on the World Heritage List 2000

Criteria (iii)(iv)

Year(s) of inscription on the List of World Heritage in Danger 2016-present

Threats for which the property was inscribed on the List of World Heritage in Danger

- Large-scale urban development projects carried out without informing the Committee or commissioning the necessary heritage impact assessments
- Demolition and rebuilding of traditional housing areas
- Irreversible changes to the original appearance of a large area within the historic centre
- Significant alteration of the setting of monuments and the overall historical town planning structure and its archaeological layers
- Absence of conservation and Management Plan

Desired state of conservation for the removal of the property from the List of World Heritage in Danger

Not yet drafted

Corrective measures identified

Not yet identified

Timeframe for the implementation of the corrective measures

Not yet identified

Previous Committee Decisions see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/885/documents/>

International Assistance

Requests approved: 1 (from 1999 to 2018)

Total amount approved: USD 15,000

For details, see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/885/assistance/>

UNESCO Extra-budgetary Funds

2016: USD 30,670 from the UNESCO/Netherlands Funds-in-Trust project for the Application of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on Historic Urban landscape (HUL) at the World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan

Previous monitoring missions

October 2002: Monitoring mission by an international expert; March 2006: UNESCO Tashkent/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; June 2014: UNESCO Tashkent fact-finding mission; March 2016: joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; December 2016: joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission; January 2019: joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS High-Level Reactive Monitoring mission;

Factors affecting the property identified in previous reports

- Management systems/management plan (Lack of a comprehensive conservation and management plan)
- Management activities
- Housing; Commercial development (Major interventions carried out, including demolition and re-building activities)
- Legal framework (Need to reinforce the national legal framework)
- Human resources (inadequate)
- Financial resources (inadequate)

Illustrative material see page <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/885/>

Current conservation issues

On 3 January 2019, the State Party submitted a state of conservation report, which is available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/885/documents>. Subsequently a joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS High-Level Reactive Monitoring mission visited the property from 23 to 26 January 2019 (mission report available at <http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/885/documents>).

In response to the Committee's requests for more documentation to allow a clearer understanding of the impact of recent major demolitions, the State Party provided the following data:

- Map of the general distribution of traditional houses, although without comparisons with maps developed before recent demolitions;
- List of streets/houses, but no formal inventories;
- 2018 map showing the general distribution of traditional dwellings;
- Map showing locations of demolished *mahallah* (dated 2014);
- Table of work on the restoration of monuments carried out mainly in 2014-5;
- Architectural plans of important monuments with Russian text;
- Chart indicating reduction of housing density between 2013 and 2015 and plans for further reductions by 2020;
- Description of the 'current General Plan of the city' and the Master Plan established in 1988.

Within the text headed 'General architectural planning solution', it indicated that there are plans in place to:

- Remove structures around monuments in order to allow them to be viewed from all angles;
- Create a tourist complex to include 'historic sites' designed in the 'spirit of Eastern architecture';
- Reconstruct one-storey houses along streets with shops, catering facilities and various community services, and reconstruct the main residential streets to serve the local population;
- Build traditional residential houses adjacent to the pedestrian road on part of the Urda mahalla and the northern part of the Kushkhovuz mahalla;
- Gradually replace modern materials on house facades.

It is also reported that in response to the Committee's requests, work has begun on reducing the number of decorative light fixtures while gates and lattice fences have been removed.

The Committee's requests for information on the following were not addressed:

- Progress with implementing the recommendations of the Committee and the December 2016 joint World Heritage Centre /ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission, notably regarding protection, management, and the tile decay on the façade of the Ak-Saray Palace;
- Capacity building related to the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) and Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) processes;
- Exploration of possible boundary modifications based on some of the monuments and the remaining urban areas that might have the potential to justify Outstanding Universal Value (OUV).

The 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission explored options for the potential recovery of attributes and whether a significant boundary modification based on some of the monuments and the remaining urban areas might have the potential to justify OUV. The mission's recommendations built on those of earlier missions but also took account of the fact that a new Presidential Decree of June 2018 had been approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of Uzbekistan to protect all World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan, and that the 2014 Decree for the rebuilding of the historic centre has been withdrawn.

The 2019 mission considered two possible options: a selection of Temurid monuments, and the key elements of the Temurid urbanism including the urban fabric of the *mahalla*. The 2019 mission did not have the necessary documentation to explore in detail either of these proposals or how OUV might be justified. It recommended that if the State Party wished to explore either, it would need to undertake

further research, documentation, and a restoration plan, all of which could take time, before the potential of each option to justify OUV might be assessed, as defined in the *Operational Guidelines*. Whether or not either of these options is progressed, in the best interests of what remains of the town, the 2019 mission set out recommendations to improve protection, conservation and management.

Analysis and Conclusions of the World Heritage Centre, ICOMOS and ICCROM

The state of conservation report provided by the State Party defines the basis of a number of projects in the historical part of Shakhrysbaz as a contract established in 2013 by the City of Shakhrysbaz on the basis of a 2006 City Master Plan. That the Presidential Decree for rebuilding of the historical part of Shakhrysbaz has been withdrawn in 2018 was not indicated in the report.

The recommendations of the 2019 Reactive Monitoring mission need to be set into the context of the 2016 Reactive Monitoring missions, the subsequent Decisions of the World Heritage Committee, the new legal framework of the Presidential decrees, the building moratorium that was put in place in 2016 and is still in place, the near completion of a building survey to recover traditional building techniques and socially revitalize the *mahalla*, and the State Party's expressed commitment to try and recover lost attributes and make amends for past actions.

At its 41st session in 2017, the Committee (Decision **41 COM 7A.57**) noted with concern the conclusions of the December 2016 Reactive Monitoring mission that *"as the monumental buildings have now been disengaged from their urban surroundings, the heart of the Temurid town planning has been lost and, as the traditional dwelling houses in the core of the medieval town have been destroyed, the key attributes of the OUV have been damaged to such an extent, and for the most part irreversible, that property can no longer convey the OUV for which it was inscribed"*, hence recovering sufficient attributes to justify the OUV identified at the time of inscription seemed impossible. The Committee was tasked with considering whether the property had *"deteriorated to such an extent that it has lost the attributes of the OUV defined at the time of inscription and should therefore, in accordance with Paragraph 192 of the Operational Guidelines, be deleted from the World Heritage List"*. It nevertheless decided to recommend that the State Party should explore whether a significant boundary modification based on some of the monuments and the remaining urban areas might have the potential to justify OUV. The State Party did not suggest any possible boundary modification in its 2018 State of conservation report but, following further discussions at its session in 2018, the Committee recommended that the State Party invite a High Level Reactive Monitoring mission to *"discuss with the relevant Uzbek authorities and stakeholders possible mitigation of the impacts to the attributes that convey the property's OUV and/or possible major boundary modification to the property"*.

The 2019 mission considered that the main threat to the property was the implementation of the 2014 Master Plan, 'State Programme for complex measures for the building and reconstruction of Shakhrysbaz city' that called for large scale demolitions and redevelopment of the central area of the Historic Centre. This plan was rescinded in 2018 but only after major demolition had taken place. Furthermore, the absence of a Management Plan integrated with the Master Plan of the city, in line with the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL), and the inadequate legal protection and administrative structures, as well as inadequate documentation were other compounding factors.

The 2019 mission thus proposed two options that the State Party might wish to explore:

- The first option would entail focusing on the monuments representing the Temurid period. The State Party presented the mission with 13 such monuments from the previous total of 18. The mission considered that the two most significant issues to be considered with regard to a selection of monuments in their current conditions are their authenticity and their disengagement from their urban surroundings. Hence, actions would be necessary to reconnect them to the urban fabric and to improve or reverse recent conservation work in order to meet conditions of authenticity and integrity;
- The second option the mission proposed was to explore the key elements of the Temurid urbanism within the Historic Centre. The mission explored in a preliminary way the scope of these elements. They might include the main north-south and east-west axes intersecting in the Historic Centre with its main market, residential quarters representing a spatial and social hierarchy, city walls and gates, the main mosques, and madrassas along with the key monuments.. The mission considered that there might be potential to recover the urban street patterns in several parts of the property and to re-vitalize traditional building technologies. This option would need to be based on detailed research of the urban grain, the specificities of vernacular building traditions,

and what has survived, and would need to be supported by measures to upgrade infrastructure and living conditions in order to ensure a living city, and the development of new protection, conservation and management systems.

The 2019 mission did not have the necessary documentation to allow thorough assessment of whether OUV might be justified for either of these options and suggested that much more work would be needed by the State Party in the form of research, documentation, conservation, and plans for a possible reversal of recent conservation work in the case of the monuments, before it might be possible to assess whether or not either of these options might have the potential to justify OUV. The report from the State Party outlines further planned work and has no reference to the rescinding of the 2014 Decree, indicating that the report may have been prepared prior to it. The State Party report also makes no reference to the moratorium on any new construction that is in place or to the 2018 Presidential Decree regarding the protection of historic city centres suggesting inadequate documentation and accuracy in reporting.

The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies welcome the new Presidential Decree of June 2018 to protect the World Heritage properties of Uzbekistan including Shakhrisabz, and also ongoing changes to the administrative and management structures for the World Heritage properties outlined to the mission, and note that while opportunities remain limited, the positive actions that have taken place since 2016 might indicate a shift in the momentum for recovery.

Nevertheless, the situation the property now faces is complex. The World Heritage Centre and the Advisory Bodies suggest that, should the State Party wish to explore possible options, the Committee agree to give a time limit of, for example, two years, to allow the State Party to explore possible options for a significant boundary modification or a new nomination.

At the end of this two-year period, the Committee would consider once again whether the property should be retained on the World Heritage List. Should adequate research and documentation have been undertaken along with compliance with the number of recommendations by the two missions, and if a clear potential to justify OUV has emerged, the Committee may decide to allow further time for a significant boundary modification or a new nomination to be prepared. An interim progress report would need to be submitted by the State Party at the end of the first year of the two-year period. For this path to be effective, the State Party may need to be encouraged to request upstream support. There would also be a need to retain a complete building moratorium in place in the property until a significant boundary modification has been considered and a Management Plan integrated with a city Master Plan in line with the HUL approach has been prepared and adopted.

Draft Decision: 43 COM 7A.43

The World Heritage Committee,

1. Having examined Document WHC/19/43.COM/7A.Add.2,
2. Recalling Decisions **39 COM 7B.74**, **40 COM 7B.48**, **41 COM 7A.57**, and **42 COM 7A.4**, adopted at its 39th (Bonn, 2015), 40th (Istanbul/UNESCO, 2016), 41st (Krakow, 2017) and 42nd (Bahrain, 2018) sessions respectively;
3. Welcomes the Presidential Decree of June 2018 to protect all World Heritage properties in Uzbekistan;
4. Notes that the 2014 Decree for rebuilding the historic centre of the property has been withdrawn;
5. Also notes that the State Party has provided some general documentation in response to the request by the Committee, but that this does not allow a full comparison of what exists now with what existed before the recent demolitions;
6. Further notes that although the State Party was requested to halt all further work at the property until the 43rd session, it has provided details of planned interventions relating

to proposals for removing structures around monuments, creating a tourist complex in the 'spirit of Eastern architecture', reconstructing one-storey houses along streets, as well as new residential streets for the local population that are in contradiction to the State Party's two Presidential Decrees of 2018;

7. Recalls the December 2016 joint World Heritage Centre/ICOMOS Reactive Monitoring mission's conclusion that "recovering sufficient attributes to justify the Outstanding Universal Value (OUV) identified at the time of inscription seems impossible at this stage" (Decision **41 COM 7A.57**);
8. Notes furthermore that as recommended in Decision **42 COM 7A.4**, the State Party invited a High-Level Reactive Monitoring mission to explore "options for the potential recovery of attributes" and "whether a significant boundary modification based on some of the monuments and the remaining urban areas might have the potential to justify OUV";
9. Notes moreover that the 2019 High-Level Reactive Monitoring mission suggested that the State Party might wish to explore two options for a significant boundary modification, based on either a selection of Timurid monuments or on key elements of Timurid urbanism, including the urban fabric of the mahalla that might have the potential to be recovered, but that the mission did not have the necessary documentation to allow it to explore in detail either of these proposals or how OUV might be justified;
10. Recommends that, if the State Party wishes to explore either option, it should undertake further research and documentation and develop a restoration plan, in order to provide sufficient details to allow assessment of the potential for each option to justify OUV, before any work is undertaken on a significant boundary modification in compliance with Paragraphs 165 and 166 of the Operational Guidelines or on a new nomination;
11. Also recommends the State Party to consider the following options as the outcome of the 2019 mission:
 - a) The first option would entail focusing on the monuments representing the Timurid period. The State Party presented the mission with 13 such monuments from the previous total of 18. The Mission considered that the two most significant issues to be considered with regard to a selection of monuments in their current conditions are their authenticity and their disengagement from their urban surroundings. Hence, actions would be necessary to reconnect them to the urban fabric and to improve or reverse recent conservation work in order to meet conditions of authenticity and integrity,
 - b) The second option the Mission proposed was to explore the key elements of the Timurid urbanism within the Historic Centre. The mission explored in a preliminary way the scope of these elements. They might include the main north-south and east-west axes intersecting in the Historic Centre with its the main market, residential quarters representing a spatial and social hierarchy, city walls and gates, the main mosques, and madrassas along with the key monuments. The Mission considered that there might be potential to recover the urban street patterns in several parts of the property and to re-vitalize traditional building technologies. This option would need to be based on detailed research of the urban grain, the specificities of vernacular building traditions, and what has survived, and would need to be supported by measures to upgrade infrastructure and living conditions in order to ensure a living city, and the development of new protection, conservation and management systems;

12. Encourages the State Party to request upstream support in relation to the potential for a significant boundary modification or a new nomination to justify OUV;
13. Decides to allow the State Party two years to explore possible options for a significant boundary modification or a new nomination, and at the end of this period, to consider once again whether the property should be retained on the World Heritage List for a further period to allow time, if by then a clear direction of travel has been articulated, or to delete the property altogether;
14. Requests the State Party to retain a complete building moratorium in the property until any significant boundary modification or a new nomination has been considered by the Committee and a Management Plan for heritage conservation integrated with a city Master Plan in line with the approach of the 2011 UNESCO Recommendation on the Historic Urban Landscape (HUL) has been prepared and adopted;
15. Urges the State Party to implement the recommendations of the 2019 mission, whether or not the options proposed in Paragraph 11 above are progressed after further research;
16. Also urges the State Party to progress in the implementation of the Committee's recommendations for the conservation of the Ak-Saray Palace tiles and to develop a conservation strategy and submit it to the World Heritage Centre for review by the Advisory Bodies before any work is undertaken;
17. Also requests the State Party to submit to the World Heritage Centre, by **1 February 2020**, an updated report on the state of conservation of the property including a report on the progress in the exploration of options and the implementation of the above, for examination by the Committee at its 44th session in 2020;
18. **Also decides to retain Historic Centre of Shakhrisyabz (Uzbekistan) on the List of World Heritage in Danger.**